Differences in What Christians Teach on God and Spiritual Gifts - Video

July 24, 2026

This topic has more information that is not shown than is shown. Besides these 12 topics, there are 295 other teachings that four or more early Christians taught and none denied. But Protestant, Roman Catholic, Eastern Orthodox, Coptic, and Nestorian churches agree on these, so we won't discuss them here. You can see these on two web pages:
www.biblequery.org/History/churchHistory/WhatEarlyChristiansTaughtOnDoctrine.docx (and .html)
and
www.biblequery.org/History/churchHistory/WhatEarlyChristiansTaughtOnExperienceAndPractice.docx (and .html).

Recap of Intro to the Analytical Study of Early Church History
Pre-Nicene Christians had a consensus of at least 4 authors taught and none denied on over 1,237 teachings.
All but 7 were taught by at least one writer between 325-431 A.D. too.
All Christian churches today, would agree on all of these except for about 44.
At least one church today would agree with every teaching except six.
See www.biblequery.org; under "Church History".
Details: www.biblequery.org/History/ChurchHistory/WhatEarlyChristiansTaughtOnDoctrine.html
www.biblequery.org/History/ChurchHistory/WhatEarlyChristiansTaughtOnExperienceAndPractice.html.

Legend
White background – A consensus of 4 or more writers taught prior to 325 A.D., and none denied. There are over 1,237 teachings; a few are shown here.
Pale yellow – No consensus
Bright yellow – Nobody taught this before 325 A.D.

GOD AND SPIRITUAL GIFTS
-Gd1. Father and Son one Substance (7-2)
-Gd2. God has wrath (21-2)
-Gd3. Explicitly say Christ has two natures (2-0)
-Gd4. Never a Time before the Son existed (7-1)
-Gd5. Jesus' will distinct from the Father's (4-1)
-Gd6. Holy Spirit sent by the Father (1-0)
-Gd7. Jesus incarnated with only one will (not two like Nestorians said) (0)
-Sg1. Tongues in church after Acts (1-0)
Ge21. God foresees all in the future (5-0)
ma1. God is timeless or before/beyond time (5-0)
Hs5. Holy Spirit addressed as "He" (not female) (12-0)
Di12. Prophesy in the church after Acts (8-0)

-Gd1. Father and Son one Substance (7-2)

Colossians 2:9 (Implied)

Clement of Alexandria (193-217/220 A.D.) (partial, equality of substance but not one) "There was; then, a Word importing an unbeginning eternity; as also the Word itself, that is, the Son of God, who being, by equality of substance, one with the Father, is eternal and uncreate." Fragment 1 Ch.3 *Comments on the First Epistle of John* p.574

Tertullian (c.213 A.D.) "which distributes the Unity into a Trinity, placing in their Order the three *Persons*-the Father, the Son, and the Holy Ghost: three, however, not in condition, but in degree; not in substance, but in form; not in power, but in aspect; yet of one substance, and of one condition, and of one power, inasmuch as He is one God, from whom these degrees and forms and aspects are reckoned, under the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost." *Against Praxeas* ch.2 p.598

Hippolytus of Portus (225-234/5 A.D.) "The Logos alone of this *God* is from *God* himself; wherefore also *the Logos* is God, being *the* substance of God." *Refutation of All Heresies* book 10 ch.29 p.151

X AGAINST **Origen** (225-254 A.D.) "The Saviour is here called simply light. But in the Catholic Epistle of this same John we read that God is light. This, it has been maintained, furnishes a proof that the Son is not in substance different from the Father. Another student, however, looking into the matter more closely and with a sounder judgment, will say that the light which shines in darkness and is not overtaken by it, is not the same as the light in which there is no darkness at all. The light which shines in darkness comes upon this darkness, as it were, and is pursued by it, and, in spite of attempts made upon it, is not overtaken. But the light in which there is no darkness at all neither shines on darkness, nor is at first pursued by it, so as to prove victor and to have it recorded that it was not overtaken by its pursuer. The third designation was "the true light." But in proportion as God, since He is the Father of truth, is more and greater than truth, and since He is the Father of wisdom is greater and more excellent than wisdom, in the same proportion He is more than the true light. We may learn, perhaps, in a more suggestive manner, how the Father and the Son are two lights, from David, who says in the thirty-fifth Psalm, "In Thy light we shall see light." This same light of men which shines in darkness, the true light, is called, further on in the Gospel, the light of the world; Jesus says, "I am the light of the world."" *Commentary on John* book 2 ch.18 p.336-337

Theognostus of Alexandria (260 A.D.) "The substance of the Son is not a substance devised extraneously, nor is it one introduced out of nothing; but it was born of the substance of the Father, as the reflection of light or as the steam of water. For the reflection is not the sun itself, and the steam is not the water itself, nor yet again is it anything alien; neither is He Himself the Father, nor is He alien, but He an emanation from the substance of the Father, this substance of the Father suffering the while no partition. For as the sun remains the same and suffers no diminution from the rays that are poured out by it, so neither did the substance of the Father undergo any change in having the Son as an image of itself." *Seven Books of Hypotyposes or Outlines* ch.1 p.155

Dionysius of Alexandria (246-265 A.D.) "The plant that springs from the root is something distinct from that whence it grows up; and yet it is of one nature with it. And the river which flows from the fountain is something distinct from the fountain. For we cannot call either the river a fountain, or the fountain a river. Nevertheless we allow that they are both one according to nature, and also one in substance; and we admit that the fountain may be conceived of as father, and that the river is what is begotten of the fountain." *On the One Substance* p.120

Dionysius of Alexandria (246-265 A.D.) Letter 4 *Epistle to Dionysius Bishop of Rome* ch.7 p.93 says that God is the spring or source of all good things, and the son is a river flowing out of Him. The word is an emanation of the mind.

Dionysius of Rome (259-269 A.D.) (implied) "they [Sabellians] divide the holy unit into three different substances, absolutely separated from one another."

X AGAINST **Pierius of Alexandria** (275 A.D.) speaks of two substances and two natures, except that Photius says that Pierius means persons, not really substances. *From the Writings of Pierius* p.157

Peter of Alexandria (306,285-311 A.D.) "together with the entire people, celebrated a typical and shadowy Passover, the Creator and Lord of every visible and invisible creature, the only-begotten Son, and the Word co-eternal with the Father and the Holy Spirit, and of the **same substance with them**, according to His divine nature, our Lord and God, Jesus Christ," Fragment 5 ch.7 p.282

Lactantius (c.303-325 A.D.) "Since, therefore, the Father makes the Son, and the Son the Father, they both have one mind, one spirit, one substance; but the former is as it were an overflowing fountain, the latter as a stream flowing forth from it: the former as the sun, the latter as it were a ray extended from the sun. And since He is both faithful to the Most High Father, and beloved by Him, He is not separated from Him; just as the stream is not separated from the fountain, nor the ray from the sun: for the water of the fountain is in the stream, and the light of the sun is in the ray: just as the voice cannot be separated from the mouth, nor the strength or hand from the body." *The Divine Institutes* book 4 ch.29 p.132

From the Council of Nicea I until the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

Hegemonius (before 348 A.D.) quoting Archelaus (277/278 A.D.) "Furthermore, there is but one only inconvertible substance, the divine substance, eternal and invisible, as is known to all," and speaks of the invisibility of God. *Disputation with Manes* ch.32 p.205

Later times

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) says the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit are one substance or nature. Part 1 section 2 245 p.65

Among heretics

X Arians denied this.

Semi-Arianism

According to Athanasius of Alexandria we should not treat as enemies those who agreed with everything at Nicea except that they objected to the term "One in Essence" These are semi-Arians p.78
Basil of Ancyra
341 A.D. Mark's of Arethusa *ANF* p.78
344 A.D. Macrostitch Creed
351 A.D. First Council of Sirmium

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree that the Father, Son and Holy Spirit are all one substance.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) says the Father and Son are one Substance. Part 1 254 p.65 and 1.465 p.117

-Gd2. God has wrath (21-2)

God has wrath against sin. Ps 75:8; Isa 51:17,22; Jer 25:15; Ezek 23:31-37

p115 (=Papyrus Oxyrhynchus 4499) 119 verses of Revelation. 2:1-3,13-15,27-29; 3:10-12; 5:8-9; 6:5-6; 8:3-8,11-13; 9:1-5,7-16,18-21; 10:1-4,8-11; 11:1-5,8-15,18-19; 12:1-5,8-10,12-17; 13:1-3,6-16,18; 14:1-3,5-7,10-11,14-15,18-20; 15:1,4-7 (middle to late 3rd century) Revelation 11:18

Clement of Rome (96-98 A.D.) "For it is written, 'Enter into thy secret chambers for a little time, until my wrath and fury pass away; and I will remember a propitious day, and will raise you up out of your graves.'" *1 Clement* ch.50 p.18

X Against Clement of Rome (96/98 A.D.) "and let us look stedfastly to the Father and Creator of the universe, and cleave to His mighty and surpassingly great gifts and benefactions, of peace. Let us contemplate Him with our understanding, and look with the eyes of our soul to His long-suffering will. Let us reflect how free from wrath He is towards all His creation." *1 Clement* ch.19 p.10

X *Mathetes to Diognetus* (c.130-200 A.D.) ch.8 p.28 says, "He [God] was always of such a character, and still is, and will ever be, kind and good, and free from wrath, and rue, and the only one who is [absolutely] good;"

Ignatius (100-117 A.D.) "Let us therefore be of a reverent spirit, and fear the long-suffering of God, that it tend not to our condemnation. For let us either stand in awe of the wrath to come, or show regard for the grace which is at present displayed-one of two things. Only [in one way or another] let us be found in Christ Jesus unto the true life." *Ignatius' Epistle to the Ephesians* ch.11 p.54

Justin Martyr (c.150 A.D.) quotes Psalms 2. *First Apology of Justin Martyr* ch.40 p.176

Tatian's ***Diatessaron*** (c.172 A.D.) section 6.19 p.52 "Whosoever believeth in the Son hath eternal life; but whosoever obeyeth not the Son shall not see life, but the wrath of God cometh upon him."

Melito of Sardis (170-177/180 A.D.) "*The anger and wrath of the Lord* - the vengeance of the Deity upon sinners, when He bears with them with a view to punishment, does not *at once* judge them according to *strict* equity. As in the Psalm: 'In His anger and in His wrath will He trouble them.'" *On the Lord's Passion* p.761

Theophilus of Antioch (168-181/188 A.D.) says that God is angry with those who act wickedly. *Theophilus to Autolycus* book 1 ch.3 p.90

Irenaeus of Lyons (c.160-202 A.D.) "but they who now reject His goodness shall know His power in judgment, according to that which the blessed apostle says: 'Not knowing that the goodness of God leadeth thee to repentance; but according to thy hardness and impenitent heart thou treasurest up for thyself wrath in the day of wrath and of the revelation of the righteous judgment of God, who shall render to every man according to his works'" *Proof of Apostolic Preaching* ch.8

Irenaeus of Lyons (182-188 A.D.) "If the Egyptians had not been afflicted with plagues, and, when pursuing after Israel, been choked in the sea, God could not have saved His people, this answer may be given;-Unless, then, the Jews had become the slayers of the Lord (which did, indeed, take eternal life away from them), and, by killing the apostles and persecuting the Church, had fallen into an abyss of wrath, we could not have been saved." *Irenaeus Against Heresies* book 4 ch.3 p.465

Clement of Alexandria (193-217/220 A.D.) "'Wherefore I was grieved with that generation, and said, They do always err in heart, and have not known My ways. So I sware in my wrath, they shall not enter into My rest.' Look to the threatening! Look to the exhortation! Look to the punishment!'" *Exhortation to the Heathen* ch.9 p.196

Clement of Alexandria (193-217/220 A.D.) "Mortify therefore your members which are upon the earth; fornication, uncleanness, inordinate affection, and concupiscence, and covetousness, which is idolatry: for which things' sake cometh the wrath of God upon the children of disobedience,' cries the apostle." *The Instructor* book 3 ch.11 p.288

Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) "For just as, after the waters of the deluge, by which the old iniquity was purged-after the baptism, so to say, of the world-a *dove* was the herald which announced to the earth the assuagement of celestial wrath, when she had been sent her way out of the ark, and had returned with the olive-branch, a sign which even among the nations is the fore-token of *peace*; so by the self-same law of heavenly effect, to earth-that is, to our flesh -as it emerges from the font, after its old sins flies the *dove* of the Holy Spirit, bringing us the peace of God, sent out from the heavens where is the Church, the typified ark." *On Baptism* ch.8 p.673

Tertullian (207/208 A.D.) “Other qualities likewise are good, by means of which the good work of a good severity runs out its course, whether wrath, or jealousy, or sternness. For all these are as indispensable to severity as severity is to justice. The shamelessness of an age, which ought to have been reverent, had to be avenged. Accordingly, qualities which pertain to the judge, when they are actually free from blame, as the judge himself is, will never be able to be charged upon him as a fault.” *Five Books Against Marcion* book 2 ch.6 p.309

Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) “Let none seduce you with empty words: on this account cometh the wrath of God upon the sons of unbelief.” *On Modesty* ch.17 p.93

Hippolytus of Portus (225-235/236 A.D.) “And Paul in like manner: ‘For the wrath of God is revealed from heaven against all ungodliness and unrighteousness of men, who hold the truth of God in unrighteousness.’” [Romans 1:17] *Treatise on Christ and Antichrist* ch.64 p.218

Commodianus (c.240 A.D.) “In the law, the Lord of heaven, and earth, and sea has commanded, saying, Worship not vain gods made by your own hands out of wood or gold, lest my wrath destroy you for such things.” *Instructions of Commodianus* ch.2 p.203

Origen (225-253/254 A.D.) “treasuring up for thyself wrath on the day of judgment and of the revelation of the just judgment of God, who will render to every one according to his work: to those who by patient continuance in well-doing seek for glory and immortality, eternal life;” [both Greek and Latin] *de Principiis* book 3 ch.1.5 p.306

X Origen (225-253/254 A.D.) “Moreover, that ‘wrath’ is no passion on the part of God, but that each one brings it upon himself by his sins, will be clear from the further statement of Paul: ‘Or despisest thou the riches of His goodness, and forbearance, and long-suffering, not knowing that the goodness of God leadeth thee to repentance?” *Origen Against Celsus* ch.4.72 p.529

Novatian (240/254-257 A.D.) “Moreover, if we read of His wrath, and consider certain descriptions of His indignation, and learn that hatred is asserted of Him, yet we are not to understand these to be asserted of Him in the sense in which they are human vices. For all these things, although they may corrupt man, cannot at all corrupt the divine power. For such passions as these will rightly be said to be in men, and will not rightly be judged to be in God.” *Concerning the Trinity* ch.5 p.615

Treatise Against Novatian (254-256 A.D.) ch.17 p.663 “Moreover, too, the apostle, giving good advice, thus exhorts us, saying, ‘Let no one deceive you with vain words: for because of these things the wrath of God cometh upon the children of disobedience. Be not partakers with them.’”

Cyprian of Carthage (c.246-258 A.D.) “with a rod of iron; and He shall tread the winepress of the wrath of God Almighty. See also He has on His garment and on His thigh the name written, King of kings, and Lord of lords.” *Treatises of Cyprian* Treatise 12 book 2 ch.30 p.528

Gregory Thaumaturgus (240-265 A.D.) “‘For fornication,’ it says, ‘and covetousness *are things* on account of which the wrath of God cometh upon the children of disobedience. Be not ye therefore partakers with them.” *Canonical Epistle* canon 2 p.18

Victorinus of Petau (martyred 304 A.D.) “By the angel flying through the midst of heaven is signified the Holy Spirit bearing witness in two of the prophets that a great wrath of plagues was imminent.” *Commentary on the Apocalypse* from the eight chapter verse 13 p.352

Peter of Alexandria (306,285-311 A.D.) “Hence, when the Lord reproves them by the prophet, He says, ‘They do always err in their heart; and I have sworn in My wrath that they shall not enter into My rest.’“ *Fragment That Up to the Time of the Destruction of Jerusalem* ch.3 p.281

Methodius (270-311/312 A.D.) “Nor do they understand that by it also the death of Christ is personified, by whose blood souls made safe and sealed shall be preserved from wrath in the burning of the world; whilst the first-born, the sons of Satan, shall be destroyed with an utter destruction by the avenging angels, who shall reverence the seal of the Blood impressed upon the former.” *The Banquet of the Ten Virgins* discourse 9 ch.1 p.345

Lactantius (c.303-320/325 A.D.) "He [God] delays, therefore, until the end of the times shall come, when He may pour out His wrath with heavenly power and might, as 'Prophecies of pious seers Ring terror in the wildered ears.'" *The Divine Institutes* book 2 ch.18 p.67

Alexander of Alexandria (313-326 A.D.) "For then the earth could not long hold the body of our Lord that in it was buried; but it exclaimed, O my Lord, pardon mine iniquities, save me from Thy wrath, absolve me from the curse, for I have received the blood of the righteous, and yet I have not covered the bodies of men or Thine own body!" *Epistles on the Arian Heresy* letter 5 ch.7 p.301

Eusebius of Caesarea (318-325 A.D.) "Daniel's words run thus: '16. Let thy anger be turned away, even thy anger from Jerusalem thy city, thy holy mountain.' And, 'Thy people is a source of ridicule to all that are round about them.' And again, '17. Shew thy face upon the desolation of thy sanctuary.'" *Demonstration of the Gospel* book 8

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

Athanasius (339 A.D.) says "wrath of God against us" *Defence Against the Arians* part 2 ch.35 p.118-119

Formicus Maternus (348 A.D.) Those who worship the beast "he also drinks the wine of the wrath of God mingled in the cup of his wrath, and shall be punished with fire and brimstone before the eyes of the Lamb. And the smoke of their torments shall ascend p for ever and ever; neither shall they have rest day nor night, whoever adore the beast and his image." *On the Error of Profane Religions* ch.28.13 p.115

Hegemonius of Sirmium (before 348 A.D.) translating Archelaus "And, in fine, when they are found to be actually doing his will, they are thus addressed: 'O generation of vipers, who hath warned you to flee from the wrath to come? Bring forth therefore fruits meet for repentance.'" (Archelaus is speaking) *Disputation with Manes* ch.32 p.205

X John Chrysostom (martyred 407 A.D.) says that God's spirit is free from wrath. *Commentary on Acts* ch.17 p.112

Uncertain Date but after Nicea I

A Strain of Sodom (before 496 A.D.) "Already had Almighty God wiped off By vengeful flood…" *ANF* vol.4 p.129. The author is unknown but it is similar to Genesis, where Gennadius says by Salvian of Marseilles (430-490 A.D.)

Among Heretics and Spurious Books

Recognitions of Clement book 10 ch.50 p.205 (Implied) criticizes philosophers who say that God is not angry with man. (Niceta is speaking)

Theodore of Mopsuestia (392-423/429 A.D.) mentions God's anger and wrath *Commentary on Micah* ch.6 p.235

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree that God has wrath.

-Gd3. Explicitly say Christ has two natures (1-1)

God does not say this in His word, the Bible.

No writers prior to Nicea I (325 A.D.) explicitly affirm or deny this.

The Bible does not discuss the natures of Christ; only that He is God and that He is human. Monophysites said Christ had only one blended nature, sort of like putting a teaspoon of tea into the ocean.

Tertullian (c.213 A.D.) "We see plainly the twofold state, which is not confounded, but conjoined in One Person--Jesus, God and Man. Concerning Christ, indeed, I defer what I have to say. (I remark here), that the property of each nature is so wholly preserved, that the Spirit on the one hand did all things in Jesus suitable to Itself, such as miracles, and mighty deeds, and wonders; and the Flesh, on the other hand, exhibited the affections which belong to it. It was hungry under the devil's temptation, thirsty with the Samaritan woman, wept over Lazarus, was troubled even unto death, and at last actually died. *Against Praxeas* ch.27 p.624

Tertullian (207/208 A.D.) "If I may offer, moreover, an interpretation of the two goats which were presented on 'the great day of atonement,' do they not also figure the two natures of Christ? They were of like size, and very similar in appearance, owing to the Lord's identity of aspect; because He is not to come in any other form, having to be recognised by those by whom He was also wounded and pierced." *Five Books Against Marcion* book 3 ch.7 p.327

X Origen (225-254 A.D.) says that the incarnate Jesus had a **composite nature**. *Origen Against Celsus* book 1 ch.66 p.426

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

X Athanasius (331 A.D.) (partial not) discusses how no one knew the day or the hour of Christ's return, not even the Son, only the Father. His answer is ""but why, though He knew, He said, 'No, not the Son knows,' this I think none of the faithful is ignorant, viz. that He made this as those other declarations as many by reason of the flesh. For this as before is not the Word's deficiency, but of that human nature whose property it is to be ignorant. … Certainly when He says in the Gospel concerning Himself in His human character, 'Father, the hour is come, glorify Thy Son,' it is plain that He knew also the hour of the end of all things, as the Word, though as man He is ignorant of it, for ignorance is proper to man, and especially ignorance of these things. … for since He was made man, He is not ashamed, because of the flesh which is ignorant to say 'I know not,' that He may shew that knowing as God, He is but ignorant according to the flesh.. And therefore He said not 'no, not the Son of God knows,' lest the Godhead should seem ignorant, but simply 'no, not the Son,' that the ignorance might be the Son's as born from among men." *Four Discourses Against the Arians* (331 A.D.) discourse 3 ch.43 p.417

X Eutyches, All Monophysites

After the Council of Ephesus I (431 A.D.)

Eastern Orthodox, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree that Jesus Christ has two natures, one fully divine and one fully human, but without sin.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) says the Christ has a human nature and a divine one. Part 1 464-467 p.117-118

Copts today are Miaphysites that believe Christ has two natures, with qualifications.

X Historically Copts were Monophysites and said that Christ had only one blended nature.

Among heretics

X Monophysite **Philoxenus of Mabbug** (c.498-523 A.D.) "and the Life " This Jesus, God the Word, is our truth, with His Father and with His Holy Spirit: one Trinity, one essence, one divinity, one nature from everlasting and from eternity. For there is not in Him (God) nature and nature, nor essence and essence, nor anything recent or old, but One in Three and Three ill One ; an eternal

nature and eternal persons, one essence adored with its persons from everlasting and from eternity." *Three Letters of Philoxenus* Letter 1 p.96

-Gd4. Never a Time before the Son existed (7-1)

Clement of Rome (96-98 A.D.) (implied) "The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you, and with all everywhere that are the caller of God through Him, by whom be to Him glory, honour, power, majesty, and eternal dominion, from everlasting to everlasting. Amen." *1 Clement* ch.59 vol.1 p.21. See also vol.9 ch.65 p.248

Ignatius of Antioch (-107/116 A.D.) (implied) "who are most dear to me, and are entrusted with the ministry of Jesus Christ, who was with the Father before the beginning of time and in the end was revealed." *Letter of Ignatius to the Magnesians* ch.6 p.61 [Greek, Latin is similar]

Tatian's Diatessaron (died 172 A.D.) section 1 p.43 says "In the beginning was the Word, and the Word was with God, and God is the Word. This *was* in the beginning with God. Everything was by his hand, and without him not even one existing thing was *made*."

Justin Martyr (c.136-168 A.D.) (partial) "I shall give you another testimony, my friends, from the Scriptures, that God begot before all creatures a Beginning, [who was] a certain rational power [proceeding] from Himself, who is called by the Holy Spirit, now the Glory of the Lord, now the Son, again Wisdom, again an Angel, then God, and then Lord and Logos;" *Dialogue with Trypho, a Jew* ch.61 p.227

Justin Martyr (c.138-165 A.D.) (partial) says that Jesus can be called an angel, but "In this way, they teach, He [the Father] made the angels. But it is proved there are angels who always exist, and are never reduced to that form out of which they sprang. And that this power which the prophetic word calls God, as has been also amply demonstrated, and Angel, is not number [as different] in name only like the light of the sun, but is indeed something numerically distinct…" *Dialogue with Trypho the Jew* ch.128 p.264

Athenagoras (177 A.D.) "God, who is the eternal mind [*nous*], had the Logos in Himself, being from eternity instinct [distinct] with Logos [*logikos*]); but inasmuch as He came for forth to be the idea and energizing power of all material things," *A Plea for Christians* ch.10 p.133

X Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) "Because God is in like manner a Father, and He is also a Judge; but He has not always been Father and Judge, merely on the ground of His having always been God. For He could not have been the Father previous to the Son, nor a Judge previous to sin. There was, however, a time when neither sin existed with Him, nor the Son; the former of which was to constitute the Lord a Judge, and the latter a Father." *Against Hermogenes* ch.3 p.478

Dionysius of Rome (259-269 A.D.) "For if the Son was made, there was a time when He was not; but He always was, if, as He Himself declares, He is undoubtedly in the Father. And if Christ is the Word, the Wisdom, and the Power,-for the divine writings tell us that Christ is these, as ye yourselves know,-assuredly these are powers of God. Wherefore, if the Son was made, there was a time when these were not in existence; and thus there was a time when God was without these things, which is utterly absurd." *Against the Sabellians* (*ANF* vol.7) ch.2 p.365

Lucian of Antioch (c.300-311 A.D.) (implied) "And if any one, contrary to the right faith of the Scriptures, teaches and says there has been a season or time or age before the Son of God was begotten, let him be accursed." *Creed of Lucian of Antioch* in *The Creeds of Christendom* by Philip Schaff vol.2 p.27-28

Alexander of Alexandria (313-326 A.D.) "And how, if the Son is the Word or Wisdom and Reason of God, was there a time when He was not? It is all one as if they said, that there was a time when God was without reason and wisdom. How, also, can He be changeable and mutable, who says indeed by

Himself: 'I am in the Father, and the Father in Me,'" *Epistles on the Arian Heresy* Epistle 2 ch.3 p.297-298

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

Macrostich Creed (344/345 A.D.) "but God only who without time begat him [Jesus Christ]; for both times and ages were made through him." *Socrates Ecclesiastical History* book 2 ch.19 in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers* 2nd Series vol.2 p.45

Council of Ephesus (431 A.D.) "But those that say, 'There was a time when he was not, and before he was begotten he was not,… those the Catholic and Apostolic Church anathematizes." *Letter from Cyril to Nestorius* p.202

After Ephesus (431 A.D.)

Cyril of Alexandria (c.444 A.D.) "And it is with reference to this notion of a union without confusion that we proclaim the holy Virgin to be the mother of God, because God the Word was made flesh and became man, and by the act of conception united to Himself the temple that He received from her. For we perceive that two natures, by an inseparable union, met together in Him without confusion, and indivisibly. For the flesh is flesh, and not deity, even though it became the flesh of God: and in like manner also the Word is God, and not flesh, though for the dispensation's sake He made the flesh His own. But although the natures which concurred in forming the union are both different and unequal to one another, yet He Who is formed from them both is only One: nor may we separate the One Lord Jesus Christ into man severally and God severally, but we affirm that Christ Jesus is One and the Same, acknowledging the distinction of the natures, and preserving them free from confusion with one another." *Cyril's Commentary on Luke*. Luke 2.

Council of Constantinople II (May 553 A.D.) (implied. If Jesus was begotten without time, that implies God is beyond time.) It says that the Word of God had two nativities: one from all eternity of the Father, without time and body, and the other in the flesh from Mary, Mother of God. *The Capitula of the Council* canon 2 p.312

Among heretics

Nestorius (451/452 A.D.) "God the Word is unchangeable and immortal and He is continuously that where He is in the eternity of the Father. … there was not when he was not." *The Bazaar of Heracleides* book 2 ch.1 p.82

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree there was never a time before the Son existed.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) says the Son always existed. Part 1 465 p.117

-Gd5. Jesus' will distinct from the Father's (4-1)

Matthew 26:39,42; Mark 14:36; Luke 22:42; John 4:34; 6:38-39

Sinaitic Syriac (SyrS) (3rd/4th century) Matthew 1:1-6:10, 7:3-12:4; 12:6-25; 12:29-16:15; 18:11-20:24; 21:20-25:15; 25:17-20,25-26; 25:32-28:7; Mark 1:12-44; 2:21-4:17; 5:1-26; 6:5-16:18; Luke 1:36-5:28; 6:12-24:52; John 1:25-47; 2:16-4:37; 5:6-25; 5:46-18:31; 19:40-end. Matthew 26:39; Mark 14:36; Luke 22:42; John 4:34; 6:38-39

Tertullian (c.213 A.D.) "because He [the Son] had come down from heaven not to do His own will, but the will of the Father; and that the will of the Father was that every one who saw the Son, and believed on Him, should obtain the life (everlasting,) and the resurrection..." *Against Praxeas* ch.21 p.616

Novatian (250/254-257 A.D.) "Or when, unfolding the prophecies of Isaiah, he finds it written thus: 'Thus saith the Lord to Christ my Lord?' Or when he reads: 'I came not down from heaven to do mine own will, but the will of Him that sent me?'" *Concerning the Trinity* ch.26 p.637

Cyprian of Carthage (c.246-258 A.D.) "And in another place He [Jesus] says, 'I came down from heaven not to do my own will, but the will of Him that sent me.'" *Treatises of Cyprian* Treatise 4 ch.14 p.451

Dionysius of Alexandria (246-265 A.D.) discusses in detail Matthew 22:39. *An Interpretation of Luke* 22.42 p.117-118

X Lactantius (c.303-320/325 A.D.) said that the Father and Son had one will. *The Epitome of the Divine Institutes* ch.49 p.242

Among heretics

Manes (262-278 A.D.) "For He gives us His own testimony that He came down from the Father's bosom; and again He says, 'He that receiveth me, receiveth Him that sent me;' and 'I came not to do mine own will, but the will of Him that sent me;' and once more, 'I am not sent but unto the lost sheep of the house of Israel.'" (The heretic Manes is speaking) *Disputation with Manes* ch.47 p.223

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree the Son's will was distinct from the Father's, as shown I the Garden of Gethsemane.

-Gd7. Jesus incarnated with only one will (not two like Nestorians said) (0)

God does not say this in His word, the Bible.

No writers prior to Nicea I (325 A.D.) explicitly affirm or deny this.

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

X Athanasius (331 A.D.) discusses how no one knew the day or the hour of Christ's return, not even the Son, only the Father. His answer is ""but why, though He knew, He said, 'No, not the Son knows,' this I think none of the faithful is ignorant, viz. that He made this as those other declarations as many by reason of the flesh. For this as before is not the Word's deficiency, but of that human nature whose property it is to be ignorant. … Certainly when He says in the Gospel concerning Himself in His human character, 'Father, the hour is come, glorify Thy Son,' it is plain that He knew also the hour of the end of all things, as the Word, though as man He is ignorant of it, for ignorance is proper to man, and especially ignorance of these things. … for since He was made man, He is not ashamed, because of the flesh which is ignorant to say 'I know not,' that He may shew that knowing as God, He is but ignorant according to the flesh.. And therefore He said not 'no, not the Son of God knows,' lest the Godhead should seem ignorant, but simply 'no, not the Son,' that the ignorance might be the Son's as born from among men." *Four Discourses Against the Arians* (331 A.D.) discourse 3 ch.43 p.417

After the Council of Ephesus I (431 A.D.)

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) (partial) speaks against Nestorians. Part 1 466 p.117

X Council of Constantinople II (681 A.D.) says that Christ had two wills and two natural operations.

-Sg1. Tongues in church after Acts (1-0)

The Montanists practiced prophesying.

Novatian (250/4-256/7 A.D.) "This is He [the Spirit] who places prophets in the Church, instructs teachers, directs tongues, gives powers and healings, does wonderful works, offers discrimination of spirits, affords powers of government, suggests counsels, and order and arranges whatever other gifts there are of charismata; and thus make the Lord's Church everywhere, and in all, perfected and completed." *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.29 p.640-641

Today
Charismatics believe that tongues exist today.
Some Protestants and **some Roman Catholics** believe that tongues exist today.

Ge21. God foresees all in the future (5-0)

Psalm 139:16; Isaiah 44:7f

Clement of Alexandria (193-202 A.D.) "For God knows all things-not those only which exist, but those also which shall be-and how each thing shall be." *Stromata* book 6 ch.17 p.517. He says that God knows and perceives all things in *Stromata* book 7 ch.7 p.538. See also *Stromata* book 7 ch.7 p.533
Tertullian (207/208 A.D.) God foreknew all things. *Five Books Against Marcion* book 2 ch.5 p.301
Theodotus the probable Montanist (ca.240 A.D.) says that God is passionless, good, knowing all things, foreknowing all things. *Excerpts of Theodotus* ch.21 p.45
Origen (233/234 A.D.) God knows all before it happens. *Origen on Prayer* ch.5.2 p.27 and ch.5.3 p.28.
Eusebius of Caesarea (318-325 A.D.) "anticipating the future by His foreknowledge as God" *Preparation for the Gospel* book 8 ch.1 p.2

Today
Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **most Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree there was never a time before the Son existed.
X Some Protestants believe in "finite Godism" or "progressive God" where God does Not see the future with certainty.

ma1. God is timeless or before/beyond time (5-0)

[References saying that God is eternal, or always existed are not included here, if they do not specifically say God is outside of time.]

Titus 1:2 (before the beginning of time)

Ignatius of Antioch (-107/116 A.D.) Jesus Christ was with the Father before the beginning of time. *Letter of Ignatius to the Magnesians* ch.6 p.61

Ignatius (100-117 A.D.) says that God was before time, yet appeared in time. See also that God is above all time. *Letter to Polycarp* ch.3 p.99

Clement of Alexandria (193-202 A.D.) "the most ancient philosophy and primeval prophecy; and among intellectual ideas, what is oldest in origin, the timeless and unoriginated First Principle, and Beginning of existence"-the Son-from whom we are to learn the remoter Cause, the Father, of the universe, the most ancient and the most beneficent of all;" *Stromata* book 7 ch.1 (=ch.50 on-line) *Ante-Nicene Fathers* vol.3 p.523

Clement of Alexandria (193-202 A.D.) calls the Father the timeless and unoriginated First Principle *Stromata* book 7 ch.1 (=ch.50 on-line) *Ante-Nicene Fathers* vol.3 p.523

Clement of Alexandria (193-217/220 A.D.) (partial) says that God's "power working without beginning of time." *Comments on the Second Epistle of John* (fragment 1) p.576

Clement of Alexandria (193-202 A.D.) "The absence of respect of persons in God is not then in time, but from eternity." *Stromata* book 6 ch.8 p.495

Tertullian (207/208 A.D.) says that God in His goodness created time. "'Let them [the stars and luminaries] be,' says God, 'for seasons, and for days, and years.' Previous, then, to this temporal course, (the goodness) which created time had not time; nor before that beginning which the same goodness originated, had it a beginning." *Five Books Against Marcion* book 2 ch.3 p.299. See also ibid book 1 ch.8 p.276.

Victorinus of Petau (martyred 304 A.D.) (implied) "Who, then, that is taught in the law of God, who that is filled with the Holy Spirit, does not see in his heart, that on the same day on which the dragon seduced Eve, the angel Gabriel brought the glad tidings to the Virgin Mary; that on the same day the Holy Spirit overflowed the Virgin Mary, on which He made light; that on that day He was incarnate in flesh, in which He made the land and water; that on the same day He was put to the breast, on which He made the stars; that on the same day He was circumcised, on which the land and water brought forth their offspring; that on the same day He was incarnated, on which He formed man out of the ground; that on the same day Christ was born, on which He formed man; that on that day He suffered, on which Adam fell; that on the same day He rose again from the dead, on which He created light?" *On the Creation of the World* ch.343

Alexander of Alexandria (313-326 A.D.) "But if it be true that 'all things were made by Him,' it is established that both every age and time and all space, and that "when" in which the "was not" is found, was made by Him. And is it not absurd that He who fashioned the times and the ages and the seasons, in which that 'was not' is mixed up, to say of Him, that He at some time was not? For it is devoid of sense, and a mark of great ignorance, to affirm that He who is the cause of everything is posterior to the origin of that thing." *Epistles on the Arian Heresy* ch.6 p.293

<u>Among corrupt or spurious works</u>

pseudo-Justin Martyr (168-200 A.D.) claims that Plato got the idea that time was created along with the heavens from Moses. *Justins Hortatory Address to the Greeks* ch.33 p.287

<u>From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)</u>

Macrostitch Creed (344/345 A.D.) "but God only who without time begat him [Jesus Christ]; for both times and ages were made through him." *Socrates Ecclesiastical History* book 2 ch.19 in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers* 2nd Series vol.2 p.45

Gregory of Nyssa (382-397 A.D.) (implied) "and there will be then no danger in pronouncing Him Eternal and yet not Ungenerate. On the one hand, because the existence of the Son is not marked by any intervals of time, and the infinite of His life flows back before the ages and onward beyond them in an all-pervading tide, He [Jesus] is properly addressed with the title of Eternal," *Against Eunomius* book 1 ch.37 p.100

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **most Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree there was never a time before the Son existed.

X Some Charismatics, such as YWAM (Youth with a Mission) believe that God only exists in time.

Hs5. Holy Spirit addressed as "He" (not female) (12-0)

John 14:17 "...the Spirit of truth. The world cannot accept him, because it neither sees him nor knows him. But you know him, for he lives with you and will be with you."

John 16:7 "I [Jesus] will send him to you.."

John 16:8 "When he comes, he..."

John 16:13 "he will guide you into all truth. He will not speak on his own, he will speak only what he hears, and he will tell you what is yet to come. He will bring glory to me."

Romans 8:16 "The Spirit himself testifies"

Romans 8:26 "but the Spirit himself..."

1 Corinthians 12:11 "All these are the work of one and the same Spirit, and he gives them to each one, just as he determines."

p75 Luke 3:18-22; 3:33-4:2; 4:34-5:10; 5:37-6:4; 6:10-7:32; 7:35-39,41-43; 7:46-9:2; 9:4-17:15; 17:19-18:18; 22:4-24,53; John 1:1-11:45; 48-57; 12:3-13:1,8-9; 14:8-29;15:7-8; (175-225 A.D.) John 14:17

p22 (=P. Oxyrhynchus 1228) (John 15:25-16:2; 16:21-32 17 verses) (c.250 A.D.) John 15:26;

Shepherd of Hermas (c.115-155 A.D.) 2nd part tenth commandment ch.2 p.27 "Both actions grieve the Spirit: doubt, because it did not accomplish its object; and anger grieves the Spirit, because it did what was wicked. Both these are grievous to the Holy Spirit-doubt and anger. Wherefore remove grief from you, and crush not the Holy Spirit which dwells in you, lest he entreat God against you, and he withdraw from you."

Justin Martyr (c.138-165 A.D.) "And in order that the Holy Spirit may convince [us] of this, He said by the holy David, 'The gods of the nations, reputed gods, are idols of demons, and not gods;" *Dialogue with Trypho, a Jew* ch.55 p.222

Tatian's ***Diatessaron*** (c.172 A.D.) section 45 line 44 p.113 is addressed as "He" and called the Spirit of Truth.

Irenaeus of Lyons (182-188 A.D.) "and where the Spirit of God is, there is the Church, and every kind of grace; but the Spirit is truth. Those, therefore, who do not partake of Him, are neither nourished into life from the mother's breasts, nor do they enjoy that most limpid fountain which issues from the body of Christ; but they dig for themselves broken cisterns out of earthly trenches," *Irenaeus Against Heresies* book 3 ch.24.1 p.458

Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas (c.201/205 A.D.) (*ANF* vol.3) preface p.699 "consider the other powers of the Holy Spirit as an agency of the Church for which also He was sent, administering all gifts in all,"

Clement of Alexandria (c.195 A.D.) "If you wish to learn, the Holy Spirit will show you: 'And saw my works', He says, 'forty years. Wherefore I was grieved with that generation, and said, They do always err in heart, and have not known My ways'" *Exhortation to the Heathen* ch.9 p.196

Tertullian (c.213 A.D.) "For it was certainly of the Holy Spirit that the virgin conceived; and that which He conceived, she brought forth." *Against Praxeas* ch.27 p.623

Hippolytus of Portus (222-235/236 A.D.) "and as the Father wills our belief to be, let us believe; and as He wills the Son to be glorified, let us glorify Him; and as He wills the Holy Spirit to be bestowed, let us receive Him." *Against the Heresy of One Noetus* ch.9 p.227

Origen (c.227-240 A.D.) "And I consider that the Holy Spirit supplies to those who, through Him and through participation in Him, are called saints, the material of the gifts, which come from God; so that the said material of the gifts is made powerful by God, is ministered by Christ, and owes its actual existence in men to the Holy Spirit." *Commentary on John* book 2 ch.6 p.329

Novatian (250/4-256/7 A.D.) "But this Holy Spirit the Lord Christ calls at one time 'the Paraclete,' at another pronounces to be the 'Spirit of truth.' And He is not new in the Gospel, nor yet even newly given; for it was He Himself who accused the people in the prophets, and in the apostles gave them the appeal to the Gentiles." *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.29 p.640

Treatise on Rebaptism (c.250-258 A.D.) ch.17 p.677 "when the Holy Spirit had descended upon the disciples, that they might be baptized in Him, there were seen sitting upon each one tongues as if of fire, that it might be manifest that they were baptized with the Holy Ghost and with fire"

Cyprian of Carthage (c.246-258 A.D.) "you who are rather to be adorned, and that that dwelling in which God has dwelt as in a temple, in which the Holy Spirit has begun to make His abode, is of more importance than all others." *Epistles of Cyprian* Letter 1 ch.15 p.280

Methodius (270-311/312 A.D.) "And in the Book of Wisdom, a book full of all virtue, the Holy Spirit, now openly drawing His hearers to continence and chastity," *The Banquet of the Ten Virgins* discourse 1 ch.3 p.312

Lactantius (c.303-320/325 A.D.) "Therefore the Holy Spirit of God, descending from heaven, chose the holy Virgin, that He might enter into her womb." *The Divine Institutes* book 4 ch.12 p.110

Among Heretics and Spurious Books

Elchasaites (in Hippolytus) believed that Christ was male and the Holy Spirit female. Hippolytus' *Refutation of All Heresies* book 9 ch.8 p.132

The Valentinian Gnostic ***Gospel of Philip*** (150-200/250 A.D.) (Barnstone and Meyer) p.263 (implied) said that Mary was not impregnated by the Holy Spirit because a woman cannot get a woman pregnant.

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus I (325-431 A.D.)

Hegemonius of Sirmium (before 348 A.D.) Not thus is it with the Holy Spirit: God forbid; but He divides to all, and knows all kinds of tongues, and has understanding of all things, and is made all things to all men, so that the very thoughts of the heart cannot escape His cognizance. For what says the Scripture? "That every man heard the apostles speak in his own language through the Spirit, the Paraclete.'" *Archelaus Disputation with Manes* ch.36 p.210

Council of Sirmium (Greek creed) 351 A.D. mentions the Holy Spirit as "He". *Socrates Ecclesiastical History* book 2 ch.30 p.57 in *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers* 2nd Series vol.2 p.56-57.

Basil of Cappadocia (357-379 A.D.) calls the Holy Spirit "Himself" *On the Spirit* ch.1.2 p.3

Gregory of Nyssa (382-397 A.D.) refers to the Holy Spirit as "He". *Against Eunomius* book 2 ch.2 p.103

John Chrysostom (martyred 407 A.D.) The Holy Spirit is addressed as "He" *Homilies on Ephesians* homily2.14 p.56

Rufinus (374-410 A.D.) freely translating Origen (225-253/254 A.D.) "3. And since many saints participate in the Holy Spirit, He cannot therefore be understood to be a body, which being divided into corporeal parts, is partaken of by each one of the saints; but He is manifestly a sanctifying power, in which all are said to have a share who have deserved to be sanctified by His grace." *de Principiis* book 1 ch.1.3 p.242

Ambrose of Milan (379 A.D.) "that as you have received the grace of the Holy Spirit, so also you may know that He, holding so high a place in the Divine glory, has in His own Name a right to our veneration." *Letters of Ambrose* Letter 1 ch.9
others too

Today
Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **most Roman Catholics** agree the Holy Spirit is addressed as "he".
The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994)speaks of the Holy Spirit as "He". Part 1 152 p.41
X Some liberal Christians (Protestant and Roman Catholic) have portrayed the Holy Spirit as female.

Di12. Prophesy in the church after Acts (8-0)

Shepherd of Hermas (c.115-155 A.D.) claims to be a vision given by God.
Justin Martyr (c.138-165 A.D.) (partial) "Now, it is possible to see amongst us women and men who possess gifts of the Spirit of God;" *Dialogue with Trypho, a Jew* ch.88 p.243
Evarestus (c.169 A.D.) "He [Polycarp] departed, therefore, to a country house not far distant from the city. There he stayed with a few [friends], engaged in nothing else night and day than praying for all men, and for the Churches throughout the world, according to his usual custom. And while he was praying, a vision presented itself to him three days before he was taken; and, behold, the pillow under his head seemed to him on fire. Upon this, turning to those that were with him, he said to them prophetically, 'I must be burnt alive.'" *Martyrdom of Polycarp* ch.5 p.40
Martyrdom of Perpetua and Felicitas (c.201-205 A.D.) (*ANF* vol.3) ch.1.3 p.700 Perpetua asked God for a vision of prophecy whether she would be spared or martyred, and God answered her that night.
Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) (implied) was a Montanist, and they practiced healings and prophesy.
Theodotus (probable Montanist) The Montanists practiced healings and prophesy.
Origen (225-253/254 A.D.) "And there are still preserved among Christians traces of that Holy Spirit which appeared in the form of a dove. They expel evil spirits, and perform many cures, and foresee certain events, according to the will of the Logos." *Origen Against Celsus* book 1 ch.46 p.415
Novatian (250/4-256/7 A.D.) "This is He [the Spirit] who places prophets in the Church, instructs teachers, directs tongues, gives powers and healings, does wonderful works, offers discrimination of spirits, affords powers of government, suggests counsels, and order and arranges whatever other gifts there are of charismata; and thus make the Lord's Church everywhere, and in all, perfected and completed." *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.29 p.640-641
Eusebius of Caesarea (318-325 A.D.) (implied) "Neither can they [false prophets] boast of Agabus, or Judas, or Silas, or the daughters of Philip, or Ammia in Philadelphia, or Quadratus, or any others not belonging to them." *Eusebius' Ecclesiastical History* book 5 ch.17.3 p.234

Hs13. The Father sent the Holy Spirit (4-0)

John 14:16,26

Tatian's ***Diatessaron*** (c.172 A.D.) section 45:29-48 p.113-114 quotes all of John 14:1-20.
Tertullian (208-220 A.D.) quotes John 14:16 (not 1 8 not 7 words quoted) and then John 14:17a (4/30 words quoted) *Against Praxeas* ch.9 p.604. See also *Against Praxeas* c.25 p.621

Origen (225-253/254 A.D.) "Now, that the Saviour and the Holy Spirit were sent by the Father for the salvation of men has been declared in Isaiah, in the person of the Saviour, saying, 'And now the Lord hath sent me and His Spirit.'" *Commentary on Matthew* ch.13 no.18 p.486

Origen (246-248 A.D.)

Novatian (250/254-257 A.D.) quotes all of John 14:15 and the first 10/17 words of John 14:16. *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.28 p.639

Novatian (250/254-257 A.D.) quotes all of John 14:16 and the first 2/25 of John 14:17. *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.28 p.640

From the Council of Nicea I to the Council of Ephesus (325-431 A.D.)

Apostolic Constitutions (compiled c.380 A.D.) (partial not) book 3 section 2 ch.17 p.431 "The Father is the God over all; Christ is the only-begotten God, the beloved Son, the Lord of glory; the Holy Ghost is the Comforter, who is sent by Christ, land taught by Him, and proclaims Him."

Augustine of Hippo (388-430 A.D.) "Further, the Christian believes that nothing exists save God himself and what comes from him; and he believes that God is triune, i.e., the Father, and the Son begotten of the Father, and the Holy Spirit proceeding from the same Father, but one and the same Spirit of the Father and the Son." 1 ch.3.9

Synod of Toledo (589 A.D.) "It was not until the third Synod of Toledo A.D. 589, that the 'Filioque' clause was added to the Creed of Constantinople, - this difference forming, as is well known, one of the dogmatic grounds for the disunion between the Western and Easter Churches down to the present day, the latter Church denying that the Spirit proceedeth from the Father *and the Son*." *Ante-Nicene Fathers* vol.4 footnote 3 p.344.

Today

Copts, **Eastern Orthodox**, **Nestorians**, **Protestants**, and **Roman Catholics** all agree the Holy Spirit was sent by or proceeded from the Father.

The Catechism of the Catholic Church (1994) says the Father sent the Holy Spirit. Part 1 section 2 24 p.65

Hs14. Jesus sent the Holy Spirit (7-0)

John 15:26; 16:7

John 14:16,26 (partial, Jeus asks the Father to send)

p66 Bodmer II papyri - 817 verses (92%) of John (125-175 A.D.) John 715:26; 16:7

p22 (=P. Oxyrhynchus 1228) (John 15:25-16:2; 16:21-32 17 verses) (c.250 A.D.) John 15:26; 16:7

Tatian's ***Diatessaron*** (c.172 A.D.) section 46 lines 46-58 p.115 Jesus promised to send the Spirit or Comforter.

Irenaeus of Lyons (182-188 A.D.) "Afterwards, being made man for us, He sent the gift of the celestial Spirit over all the earth, protecting us with His wings. *Irenaeus Against Heresies* book 3 ch.11.8 p.429

Irenaeus of Lyons (182-188 A.D.) "Wherefore also the Lord promised to send the Comforter, who should join us to God." *Irenaeus Against Heresies* book 3 ch.17.2 p.444

Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) "although [the Holy Ghost] sent with this view by Christ, and for this asked of the Father that He might be the teacher of truth;" *On Prescription Against Heretics* ch.28 p.256

Tertullian (198-220 A.D.) "Even the Lord Himself said that the Spirit would not descend on any other conditions, but that He [the Lord Jesus] should first ascend to the Father." *On Baptism* ch.10 p.674

Origen (239-242 A.D.) (Partial) “For he [The Holy spirit] could not pass to us unless he first come down to one who shares in his own nature. *Homilies on Ezekiel* Homily 1 ch.6.1 p.36

Novatian (250/4-256/7 A.D.) quotes John 16:7. *Treatise Concerning the Trinity* ch.29 p.640

Cyprian of Carthage (c.246-258 A.D.) (implied) “He who, having been baptized among the heretics, is able to put on Christ, may much more receive the Holy Spirit whom Christ sent. Otherwise He who is sent will be greater than Him who sends; so that one baptized without may begin indeed to put on Christ, but not to be able to receive the Holy Spirit, as if Christ could either be put on without the Spirit, or the Spirit be separated from Christ. Moreover, it is silly to say, that although the second birth is spiritual, by which we are born in Christ through the layer of regeneration, one may be born spiritually among the heretics, where they say that the Spirit is not. For water alone is not able to cleanse away sins, and to sanctify a man, unless he have also the Holy Spirit.” *Epistles of Cyprian* Letter 73 ch.5 p.387-388

Adamantius (c.300 A.D.) “For He [John] knew that He [Christ] had stated, ‘I go away, and I will send the Paraclete – that is, the Holy Spirit.”(Adamantius is speaking) *Dialogue on the True Faith* First part ch.c26 p.70-71

Victorinus of Petau (martyred 304 A.D.) “For after the Lord ascended into heaven and opened all things, He sent the Holy Spirit, whose words the preachers sent forth as arrows reaching to the human heart, that they might overcome unbelief.” *Commentary the Apocalypse* from the sixth chapter no.1,2 p.350

Pre-Nicene Differences on God and Spiritual Gifts Grid – July 2026

		Legend for Cells
-Gd1. Father and Son one substance (7-2)	-Sg1. Tongues in the church after Acts (1-0)	**W** = wrote explicitly on this
-Gd2. God has wrath (21-2)	Ge21. God foresees all in the future (5-0)	I = Implied
-Gd3. Explicitly say Christ has two natures (2-0)	Ma1. God is timeless or before time (5-0)	m = Mixed or Inconsistent
-Gd4. Never a time before the Son existed (7-1)	Hs5. Holy Spirit addressed as "He" (12-0)	P = partial
-Gd5. Jesus' will distinct from the Father's (4-1)	Di12. Prophecy in the church after Acts (8-0)	- = no reference found
-Gd6. Jesus incarnated with only one will (0)	Hs13. Father sent the Holy Spirit (4-0)	**X** = Disagree

Rows: white=Christian writer, orange=schism, pink=strange writer

Christian writer	Pages	Date A.D.	Gd 1	Gd 2	Gd 3	Gd 4	Gd 5	Gd 6	Sg 1	Ge 21	Ma 1	Hs 5	Di 12	Hs 13
Clement of Rome (wrote *1 Clement*)	**16.25**	96/98	-	**m**	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Papias of Hierapolis, disciple of John	**2**	95-110	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
"Presbyters" (Papias?)	**0.5**	-95-117	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Ignatius disciple of John (shortest version)	**13**	c.100-117	-	**W**	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-
Didache (=*Teaching of the Twelve Apostles*)	**4.75**	c.60-120	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Apology of Aristides (Greek version)	**4**	125-161	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Quadratus of Athens fragment (apologist)	**.125**	126	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Epistle of Barnabas	**12.5**	c.70-130	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
2 Clement (anonymous writer)	**5.75**	120-140	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Polycarp *to the Philippians*	**3.5**	100-155	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Mathetes to Diognetus – teaching a disciple	**5.25**	c.130-200	-	**X**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Apostolic fathers totals: all symbols except P	**67.5**	-155	0	1.5-1.5	0	2	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0
Shepherd of Hermas (= *Hermas*, = *The Pastor*)	**46.5**	c.115-155	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	**W**	-
Justin Martyr, philosopher, apologist	**116.5**	c.138-165	-	-	-	P	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	P	-
Evarestus *Martyrdom of Polycarp*	**5**	c.169	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-
Tatian's *Diatessaron*	**86**	c.172	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-		-	**W**
Christians of Vienna and Lugdunum (Lyons)	**6.5**	177	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Athenagoras (apologist)	**33.5**	177	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Melito/Meleto of Sardis (Quartodecimian)	**11**	170-177	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hegesippus (chronicler)	**2.5**	170-180	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Theophilus of Antioch (*to Autolycus*)	**32**	168-181/188	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Irenaeus of Lyons, disciple of Polycarp	**284.75**	182-188	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Passion of the Scillitan Martyrs -died 180 A.D.	**0.75**	180-202	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Caius and the Muratorian Canon (Latin)	**3**	190-217	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Passion of Perpetua and Felicitas	**7**	c.201/205	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	**W**	-
Serapion of Antioch -against Marcion, Montanists	**1.333**	191/200-210	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
The Octavius of Minucius Felix	**25**	210 A.D.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Clement of Alexandria	**389**	193-202	P	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	**W**	**W**	-	-

Tertullian	**891**	198-220	**I**	**W**	**W**	**X**	**W**	-	-	**W**	**W**	**W**	**W**	W
Hippolytus, pupil of Irenaeus (undisputed)	**218**	222-235/236	**I**	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Theodotus the probable Montanist	**7.75**	ca.240	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	**W**	-
Instructions of Commodianus	**16**	ca.240	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Julius Africanus (undisputed writings)	**9**	232-245	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Martyrdom of the Holy Martyrs	**1.5**	< 250	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Origen (heterodox teacher)	**1005.15**	225-253/254	**X**	**m**	**X**	-	-	**W**	-	**W**	-	**W**	**W**	**W**
Novatian (his schism lasted over 200 years)	**38.5**	250/254-257	-	**W**	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	**W**	**W**	**W**
Treatise Against Novatian	**6.5**	254-256	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Treatise on Rebaptism	**11**	c.250-258	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Cyprian of Carthage (against Novatian)	**250.5**	c.246-258	-	**W**	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Roman church leaders (letters 2,29,30)	**1+4.75**	250-251	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Lucian et al. (letters 16, *21*)	**.875**	250-251	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Moyses, et al. to Cyprian (letter 25)	**2.5**	250	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Maximus, et al. to Cyprian (letter 49)	**0.25**	c.246-256	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Firmilian of Caesarea to Cyprian (letter74)	**7.25**	256	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Seventh Council of Carthage (85 bishops)	**7.25**	258	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Pontius' *The Life and Passion of Cyprian*	**7.5**	258	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Theognostus of Alexandria (Origenist)	**0.5**	260	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Gregory Thaumaturgus (undisputed works)	**28.5**	240-265	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Dionysius of Alexandria (Origenist)	**39.5**	246-265	**W**	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Dionysius of Rome	**1**	219-269	**I**	-	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Malchion *(Against Paul of Samosata)*	**0.25**	270	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Pierius of Alexandria (fragment)	**0.5**	275	**X**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Adamantius *Dialog on the True Faith in God*	**42**	c.300	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Arnobius Against the Heathen (undisputed)	**126.5**	297-303	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Victorinus of Petau, Austria –commentator	**18.5**	-304	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-
Pamphilus disciple of Pierius (Origenist)	**2.75**	309	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Creed of Lucian of Antioch	**0.3**	c.300-311	-	-	-	**I**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Peter of Alexandria (undisputed)	**8.5**	306-311	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Hesychius [Egypt],Pachomius,Phileas,Theodorus	**1**	-311	**W**	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Methodius (corrected Origen's followers)	**79.5**	270-311/312	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Council of Arles I, France. 26-44 bishops.	**0.333**	Aug. 314	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Council of Neocaesarea (Basil and c.19 others).	**1.333**	c.315	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Martyrdom of Habib the Deacon by Theophilus	**5.5**	event c.315	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Athanasius *Against the Heathen* & *Incarnation*	**56**	318	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Lactantius, tutor of Constantine's son	**305.5**	303-325	**W**	**W**	-	-	**X**	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-
Alexander of Alexandria-Origenist, undisputed	**11.5**	313-326	-	**W**	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	-
Eusebius of Caesarea	**1055.4**	318-325	-	**W**	-	-	-	-	-	**W**	-	-	**W**	-

25 others that do not have references.	**49.11**	170-325	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
92 Christian writer totals: all symbols except P's + Eusebius of Caesarea prior to 325 A.D.	**4425+ 1055.4**	up to 325:	7-2	21-2	1-1	7-1	4-1	0	1-0	5-0	5-0	12-0	8-0	4-0
Christian writer	Pages	Date A.D.	Gd 1	Gd 2	Gd 3	Gd 4	Gd 5	Gd 6	Sg 1	Ge 21	Ma 1	Hs 5	Di 12	Hs 13